

## **DRAFT**

# **GORDON HIGHLANDERS COMMEMORATIVE STATUE WORKING**

**GROUP – 1 OCTOBER, 2009**

## **PROJECT FRAMEWORK**

3. The Working Group had before it a report by the Director of Education, Culture and Sport, which set out the options which would form the basis of the project implementation framework for the Gordon Highlanders Commemorative Statue. The report provided a brief background to the Working Group, including detail of the funding of the statue which had been agreed at the Finance and Resources Committee on 17 September, 2009, (article 26 refers). The Committee had agreed that up to £125,000 be allocated from the Common Good Fund towards covering all costs associated with the project.

The report set out details in relation to the information pack and procurement brief which was to be distributed to interested artists regarding the project, and would provide specifications as well as providing a draft contract. It was noted that the procurement brief and draft contract would remain flexible, however, it was noted that any queries regarding the expectations of the artist should be raised early in the process to avoid any lengthy delays later on. Details of suggested locations for the statue were also provided in the report and included (1) the site of St. Nicholas House following demolition; (2) the Union Terrace Gardens development; (3) St. Nicholas shopping centre pedestrian forecourt; (4) the Town House entrance area; and (5) the Castlegate area due to its historic connections with the Gordon Highlanders. In relation to the selection of the artist, the report noted that there was a preference to widely promoting the opportunity whilst also sending personalised invitations to artists with a reputation in delivering the sort of work which was required for the project. It was noted that artists of repute would not take part in a “competition” but, however, it was noted that this did not prevent any approaches being made. The report went on to explain that from the artists’ submissions, the Selection Panel would agree on a short list of artists which they wished to interview and would receive a presentation from them on their proposals for the commemorative statue. It was recommended that the Selection Panel would consist of the Council’s Art Gallery Keeper (Fine Art), the Council’s Arts Education Co-ordinator, Chair of the Gordon Highlanders Regimental Association, the last Colonel of the Gordon Highlanders and Vice-Patron of the Gordon Highlanders Museum, the Lord Provost and Depute Provost and Councillors Boulton and Reynolds and that in the event that one of the Panel members was unable to attend, Ronald Webster would be a deputy.

The options for the selection of the statue were set out in the report and included open selection, closed selection and combination selection. The idea of combination selection allowed for a variety of options which allowed for targeted or limited input that could be more closely monitored to generate a fair result from the selected groups. It was noted that this would include a limited vote or a targeted vote which could potentially involve school children which would help it to increase

their understanding of the Gordon Highlanders. Details relating to communication and publicity surrounding the event as well as the public unveiling of the statue were provided in the report.

Sir Peter Graham advised the Working Group that he had heard from three artists who were interested in taking part in the selection process for the statue, namely, David Annand, Allan Herriot and Ian Rank-Broadley. The Working Group also noted that it would be of use to contact the short listed artists for the Bruce statue which had been agreed upon in the last year. It was noted that the artists named in conjunction with the short listed artists for the Bruce statue would provide a starting point but not an exhaustive list for potential artists for the Gordon Highlanders commemorative statue.

**The report recommended:-**

that the Working Group –

- (a) recommend to the Education, Culture and Sport Committee to agree the use of the procurement brief (Appendix A to the report) to form the basis of the information pack for circulation to artists interested in making a submission;
- (b) agree a date to undertake a walking tour of the proposed site locations prior to the next Working Group meeting (from which a recommendation on the statue's preferred location would be agreed and put forward to the Education, Culture and Sport Committee);
- (c) recommends to the Education, Culture and Sport Committee to agree the establishment of a Selection Panel for the purpose of (1) identifying a targeted list of reputable artists to be invited to become involved in the project (in addition to the general promotion that is open to those interested); and (2) recommending to the Working Group the finalists after assessing submissions, and that the Working Group be authorised to approve the finalist;
- (d) recommends to the Education, Culture and Sport Committee that the recommendation of the preferred statue is found through a weighted process using the preferences on the Selection Panel and school pupils as part of a wider arts education programme;
- (e) to outline expected communication to the Working Group once the commission is awarded (to ensure appropriate updates are provided during the lengthy development phase of the statue);
- (f) agree that a member of the Communications Team is invited to attend project meetings to advise on and maximise publicity opportunities, including the development of a communication strategy (both internal and external) for the project; and
- (g) agree that decisions on the unveiling of the statue be deferred until an appropriate time (to be guided by the Events Team) when there is greater certainty regarding the statue's completion date and other variables.

**The Working Group resolved:-**

- (i) to approve recommendation (a);
- (ii) that a walking tour of the proposed site locations would take place at 9.30am on Friday, 20 November, 2009, and that the next meeting of the Working Group would be held at 11.00am on Tuesday, 24 November;
- (iii) to recommend to the Education, Culture and Sport Committee that the Selection Panel be established as detailed in the report, with the exception of the Council's Arts Education Co-ordinator, Annette Murray, being invited

- to join the selection panel due to the original candidate declining the invitation;
- (iv) to agree to recommend to the Education, Culture and Sport Committee that the recommendation of a preferred statue be found by using the preferences of the Selection Panel and that the Working Group be authorised to approve the finalist, but that school pupils would not be involved in the selection process, and only participating in the project as part of a wider arts education programme if this incurred no cost needed from the allocated budget of £125,000 for the statue and did not present any complications for the project;
  - (v) to agree that updates be circulated to the Working Group by e-mail and by post as appropriate, and in particular after Committee decisions had been made in relation to the project, and that officers would liaise with the Lord Provost's office to ensure circulation of the information;
  - (vi) to request officers to liaise with the Communications and Events Teams and invite a member of each Team to attend project meetings as and when they felt it was necessary for them to become involved in the project; and
  - (vii) to agree that decisions on the unveiling of the statue be deferred until an appropriate time, but to note that April, June and October would be the preferred months for the unveiling.

## ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL

---

<b>WORKING GROUP:</b>	Gordon Highlanders Commemorative Statue Working Group (of Education, Culture and Sport Committee)
<b>DATE:</b>	1 October 2009
<b>DIRECTOR:</b>	Annette Bruton
<b>TITLE OF REPORT:</b>	Gordon Highlanders Commemorative Statue - project framework

---

### 1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

This report brings to the attention of the working group options that will form the basis of a project implementation framework for the Gordon Highlanders commemorative statue.

### 2. RECOMMENDATION(S)

It is recommended that the Working Group:

- a. Recommends to the Education, Culture and Sport Committee to agree the use of the procurement brief and contract (appendices A and B) to form the basis of the information pack for circulation to artists interested in making a submission.
- b. Agree a date to undertake a walking tour of the proposed site locations prior to the next working group meeting (from which a recommendation on the statue's preferred location will be agreed and put forward to the Education, Culture and Sport Committee).
- c. Agree the membership of the selection panel.
- d. Agree that the selection panel provide a targeted list of reputable artists to be invited to become involved in the project.
- e. Recommends that the Education, Culture and Sport Committee agrees that the recommendation of a preferred statue is found through a weighted process using the preferences of the selection panel and school pupils as part of a wider arts education programme.
- f. Outline expected communication to the working group once the commission is awarded (to ensure appropriate updates are provided during the lengthy development phase of the statue).
- g. Agree that a member of the communications team is invited to attend the project meetings to advise and maximise publicity opportunities, including the development of a communications strategy (internal and external) for the project.
- h. Agree that decisions on the unveiling of the statue be deferred until an appropriate time (to be guided by the events team) when there is greater certainty regarding the statue's completion date and other variables.

### 3. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The Finance and Resources Committee of 17<sup>th</sup> September 2009 resolved that up to £125,000 be earmarked from the Common Good Fund to cover the costs of producing the commemorative statue.

The Gordon Highlanders commemorative statue will be a further cultural asset to be maintained on an ongoing basis by the Council.

A proposed project budget will be developed following agreement on the project framework, including information on the capital maintenance required following the statue's installation.

#### 4. SERVICE & COMMUNITY IMPACT

The Culture (Arts and Heritage) strand of the Community Plan recognises "the importance of the traditional culture of the City and we are committed to supporting the preservation, interpretation and celebration of the history and traditions of the City." Recognition of the Gordon Highlanders meets the following key aims of the Plan:

- Cultural activity will become part of everyday life for citizens of all ages and visitors to our City.
- To encourage access to and participation in the City's cultural life.

The draft cultural strategy, Vibrant Aberdeen (2010-2015), also identifies the importance of recognising the City's heritage as part of its cultural identity.

#### 5. OTHER IMPLICATIONS

There are no other legal, equipment, sustainability, environmental, health and safety and/or policy implications and risks.

#### 6. REPORT

##### 6.1 Background

In 2008, the Resources Management Committee considered a report which addressed the following motion by Councillor Reynolds:

"That it be remitted to the appropriate Committee to consider how the Council might facilitate the design, location, construction and fundraising of a monument or piece of sculpture/statue to commemorate the Gordon Highlanders."

The report addressed possible locations and estimated costs of a monument, and set out the views of Councillor Reynolds that the monument should be funded in the same way as the King Robert the Bruce statue. It was agreed that Common Good funding would be sought to meet the costs of a monument or sculpture to commemorate the Gordon Highlanders.

At the Council meeting on 24<sup>th</sup> June 2009 the following motion was passed by Councillors Dunbar and Reynolds and the Lord Provost Stephen:

"That this Council funds and erects a commemorative statue to The Gordon Highlanders. They are part of this city's history and heritage and should be honoured and remembered with pride and gratitude for all they have done for this city and the country. Testament to this are the words from Winston Churchill who said "there is no doubt they are the finest regiment in the world".

The Council resolved:

- (i) to add “and British military” after “they are part of this city’s” within the second sentence of the motion; and to establish a cross party sub-group to take the motion forward and to invite the Gordon Highlanders to become members.

## 6.2 Current Status

The Education, Culture and Sport Committee (27 August 2009) has now confirmed the membership of the Gordon Highlanders Statue Working Group as follows:

The Lord Provost, Cllrs Jackie Dunbar, John Reynolds, Marie Boulton, Alan Milne, Jenny Laing, Sir Peter Graham, Lt Colonel Tobin Duke and Ronald Webster.

The Finance and Resources Committee (17 September 2009) agreed that up to £125,000 be allocated from the Common Good Budget towards covering all costs associated with this project.

## 6.3 Specifications

### 6.3.1 Information pack / procurement brief

An information pack will be collated to inform interested artists about the project, provide specifications, as well as providing the draft contract. The procurement brief and draft contract will remain flexible, however their inclusion in the pack provides those interested with an understanding of Aberdeen City Council’s expectations. Any queries regarding those expectations can be raised early in the process to avoid any lengthy delays.

Please refer Appendix A and B for the draft Information Pack documents for comment and refinement.

### 6.3.2 Location

Ideally the specific location would be known at the outset of the project and included in the procurement brief as it can have a fundamental impact on an artists design. If the location is known the artists can be more creative and design specifically with the space in mind. With a city centre location preferred, two future options that could house the commemorative statue include (but are not limited to):

- St Nicholas House site – following the building’s demolition there are plans for a city square to be established on the site. (Demolition will occur following the Marischal College opening in Spring 2011). Note: the Robert the Bruce statue will be located in the vicinity of Marischal College. This option would require reconsideration of the proposed completion timescale for this project of early 2011.
- Union Terrace Gardens development – a cultural precinct is anticipated to be established in Aberdeen through the building of a visual arts space in the Union Terrace Gardens. (At this stage no timeframe for the development has been established as the feasibility study on a wider options appraisal will not conclude until the end of 2009, however it would be anticipated that this option would also require reconsideration of the proposed completion timescale for this project of 2011).

While there would be ample choice of space locating the commemorative statue at a new development site, the timeframes are less certain due to the nature of construction. If the timeframe of early 2011 must be adhered to it would be sensible to consider existing locations. These include (but are not limited to):

- St Nicholas shopping centre pedestrian ‘forecourt’ onto Union Street. With established traffic flows and patterns the statue could be positioned to not interfere with access but add another dimension to the surroundings.
- The Town House entrance area (on the corner of Broad and Queen Streets). Positioned close to the footpath the statue could be designed to work in with the existing features. This is close to the Marischal College development and the St Nicholas House site that will eventually become a city square.
- The Castlegate area due to the historic connection with the Gordon Highlanders.

It is suggested that site visits occur prior to a final decision by the working group. Once a decision as to the location of the monument has been taken, the planning and property issues relating to the chosen location will be investigated further.

#### 6.4 Selection of the Artist

There is a preference to widely promote the opportunity whilst also sending personalised invitations to artists with a reputation in delivering the sort of work required. This retains the opportunity for all artists to participate but actively lets identified artists know that their involvement would be welcome. It has been suggested that artists of repute would not take part in a ‘competition’ however this does not prevent an approach being made. Suggestions of artists to approach would be well received from the working group members.

From the artists submissions, the selection panel will agree on a shortlist of artists they wish to interview (recommended four although this is flexible depending on the quality of submissions) and receive a presentation from them on their proposals for the commemorative statue. This will enable the panel to select two preferred artists who will be asked to develop miniatures, or maquettes.

It is recommended that the selection panel would consist of:

- Council’s Art Gallery Keeper (Fine Art)
- Council’s Arts Education Coordinator – (Note: Sculptor in Ordinary to the Queen in Scotland, has declined the invitation to be part of the panel. For his full response please refer Appendix C)
- Chair, Gordon Highlanders Regimental Association – Lt Colonel Tobin Duke
- Last Colonel of the Gordon Highlanders Regimental Association and Vice Patron of the Gordon Highlanders Museum – Sir Peter Graham
- Gordon Highlanders Museum – Major Norrie Donald BEM
- Aberdeen City – Councillor Jackie Dunbar
- Aberdeen City – Councillor Marie Boulton
- Aberdeen City – Councillor John Reynolds
- Aberdeen City – Lord Provost Peter Stephen

In the event one of the panel members is unable to attend, Ronnie Webster will deputise for them.

From the four interviewed artists, two preferred artists will be selected and provided with a design fee (estimate of £750 each) and costs (estimate of £500 each) to develop scale models, or maquettes, of their statues. These fees, along with advertising costs, will be funded from the £125,000 funding approved from the Common Good budget.

#### 6.5 Selection of the Statue

Once the preferred artists have presented their visions (and maquettes) for the commemorative statue it will then need to be decided how to select the 'winner'. There are a variety of options available:

6.5.1 Open selection - in a similar project (the Robert the Bruce statue), the Council opted to use a competition format to find the public's preference by asking people to cast a vote. This approach was complex and whilst intended to identify the preferred option of local citizens there were questions raised over the validity (or fairness) of the results. This approach can result in the preferred submission not being chosen on merit, but for a variety of reasons; political, aesthetic, educational and so on.

Applying the lessons learned from the Robert the Bruce project will address some of the issues of consulting with the wider public, however, there may be questions over the validity (or fair representation) of the results when conducted on a small scale (that a project such as this would undertake).

6.5.2 Closed selection – the project sub group, with elected members (who represent the views of the City's residents) and The Gordon Highlanders representatives, with officer guidance if preferred, could be the group to make the final decision on the preferred commemorative statue.

6.5.3 Combination selection – there are a variety of options that allow for targeted or limited input that can be more closely monitored to generate a fair result from the selected group(s). In addition it is possible to place an agreed weighting on their input to inform the project committee's final decision. Alternatively, the preferred statue could be determined entirely by the selected group(s) votes.

a) Limited vote

As this commemorative statue is being created to honour and remember The Gordon Highlanders, another option is to let the final decision on which statue best represents the regiment fall to those associated with The Gordon Highlanders Regimental Association. It could be argued that they are best placed to understand what the regiment embodies and how that should be represented in a piece of public art. However the working group may also wish to consider that the funding and driver for the commission is from the City Council and that only those resident in the city should be able to participate. (According to the Common Good it has long been established that its administration must be done for the benefit of the community and have regard to the interests of all the inhabitants).

b) Targeted vote

To support the educational aspect already undertaken by The Gordon Highlanders Museum and the Aberdeen City Council arts education team, there is an opportunity to develop a combined project to grow school children's understanding of The Gordon Highlanders regiment and the purpose of commemorative artwork. The education of children on the artistic aspect as well as the regiment's history would give them sufficient grounding to 'vote' for their preferred statue (based on the maquettes from the preferred artists). This could be done; with those schools where relationships already exist, by developing a new grouping or working with a targeted group such as the cadets.



The children would then follow the creation of the statue, and the opportunities for engagement maximised through an education pack that would be developed by an external facilitator brought in to coordinate the interaction with the children. Creating a meaningful experience of the regiment's history alongside the artform is likely to cost in the region of £8,400 and would need to be funded from the project budget, which is likely to impact on the amount available for the development of the statue (for a breakdown refer Appendix D).

#### 6.6 Contracting the Artist

Once the 'winner' is known a contract will be negotiated with the successful artist.

#### 6.7 Communication

6.7.1 The project working group should identify the level of involvement and / or communication it wishes to have during the various stages of the statue's development. For example the group may choose to have no formal communication except when decisions are required. Or conversely, regular email updates, meeting updates or other preferred communication methods could be provided to the working group.

6.7.2 Media coverage and handling: It is recommended that a member of the communications team is invited to attend meetings to ensure that an appropriate communications strategy is developed for this project, taking into account its value, the profile sought for the sculpture's procurement, creation and unveiling, as well as different interested parties interests and participation including; The Regimental Association, The Museum, former members of the Regiment and families, the City Council and any other views expressed within the community.

There will be opportunities as the work is being created for media coverage on an ongoing basis.

#### 6.8 Public Unveiling of Statue

With the unveiling of the commemorative statue being approximately 18 months away it is recommended that the format is agreed closer to the time once all variables are confirmed. Whilst Education, Culture and Sport will continue to provide the lead this phase should involve the expertise of Council's events team.

### 7. AUTHORISED SIGNATURE

Annette Bruton  
Director - Education, Culture & Sport  
[abruton@aberdeencity.gov.uk](mailto:abruton@aberdeencity.gov.uk)  
01224 523458

.....

### 8. REPORT AUTHOR DETAILS

Andrea Durie  
Culture and Leisure Strategy Officer  
[adurie@aberdeencity.gov.uk](mailto:adurie@aberdeencity.gov.uk)  
01224 814628

## 9. BACKGROUND PAPERS

Council meeting minutes: 26 October 2005, 24 June 2009, 19 August 2009

Council committee meeting minutes:

- Resources Management Committee - 22 November 2005, 30 March 2006
- Education, Culture and Sport Committee - 27 August 2009
- Finance and Resources Committee – 17 September 2009

## **APPENDIX A: Draft Procurement Brief**

### **THE GORDON HIGHLANDERS COMMEMORATIVE STATUE**

#### **Introduction**

Aberdeen City Council is seeking to appoint an artist to develop a design to commemorate The Gordon Highlanders regiment, which will on completion, be situated in a suitable prominent place in the centre of Aberdeen.

As part of the city's history and heritage The Gordon Highlanders commemorative statue will honour and remember (with pride and gratitude) all the regiment has done for this city and the country.

Winston Churchill said "there is no doubt they are the finest regiment in the world". The Gordon Highlanders is one of the great names in Scottish history and one of the most celebrated regiments of the British Army

Renowned as a courageous fighting force with an exceptional reputation for good conduct, professionalism and steadfastness, the legacy of The Gordon Highlanders lives on through the current serving soldiers of The Highlanders, 4th Battalion, The Royal Regiment of Scotland.

#### **Brief**

We are looking for an artist who specialises in figurative sculpture and is able to create a life-size piece that reflects the regiment's founding through to the modern day. The potential two figure, freestanding, three dimensional statue will ideally be viewed from all angles and fit within a busy city centre setting.

The artist must:

- ✓ Have a strong track record in figurative sculpture and statue.
- ✓ Experience of working in the public realm.
- ✓ Be able to deliver a strong and representative image of The Gordon Highlander's from their beginnings in 1794 through to the present day.
- ✓ Experience of working and negotiating with multi-disciplinary teams.
- ✓ Able to work and deliver to timetables.

The choice of materials that can be used in the design will be the choice of the artist, however any design must take into account the need for the final piece to be durable, vandal resistant and conform to Health and Safety regulations.

The artist will be required to liaise with colleagues within Aberdeen City Council to assist in determining the exact location of the monument, and to take this location into consideration when formulating the design.

The commission will include:

- ✓ A design with proposed materials, scale etc.
- ✓ A model of the proposed design.
- ✓ A costing for the completion of the finished piece.
- ✓ An implementation plan and possible timescale for the finished piece.

#### **Selection Procedure**

Four artists will be shortlisted to present their proposals for the commemorative statue. A panel comprising Council officers and Council-appointed project committee members will shortlist and interview applicants before selecting two artists to develop miniatures. From the miniatures a decision will then be made on who will complete the commission.

## **Fees**

The two finalists will receive a design fee of £[insert] and costs of £[insert] to create a miniature of their models/designs.

## **Submissions**

Artists are asked to submit:

1. A selection of slides or photographs of previous work.
2. A curriculum vitae.
3. Up to 2 sides of A4 detailing the approach that they would take if awarded the commission.
4. Artists should also confirm that they are available to undertake the work by **[insert date]** (for completion and installation in early 2011).
5. A self-addressed envelope, if required, for the return of slides/photographs.

## **Deadline**

Submissions must be made by **[insert date]**.

Please return submissions to:

Gordon Highlanders Commemorative Statue Submission  
Culture and Leisure Strategy Officer  
Aberdeen City Council  
4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Balgownie One, AECC  
Conference Way  
Bridge of Don  
Aberdeen  
AB23 8AQ

## **APPENDIX C: Response from Alexander Stoddart**

Dear Ms. Durie,

Many thanks for your note of 1st Inst. regarding your Public Art project. I should ask to decline, most respectfully, from involvement in this, since I do not believe in "public art" as such, and positively disapprove of art competitions, which I think ought to be avoided at all costs. An artist should simply be chosen and contracted, according to his or her past performances, to supply the very best thing he or she can do, according to his or her expertise and veteran experience. Beauty parades before selection panels are demeaning to the slaves on show, embarrassing for the more sensitive members of the panel, necessarily brutally short of proper time for consideration of the complex matters in hand and terribly upsetting for the losers - but even more so for the winner, since he or she is in a position of having conquered his fellow artists - which is always so distressing. Such things are also atrociously expensive, as your kind enquiry after the likely costs of my attendance indicates. One also has to expend lots of valuable money on rejected schemes - and monuments are always done on tight budgets; no budget, in short, for false trails.

The word "finalist" is a sporting word. But art is not to do with sport. It seeks, rather, to end all forms of fighting in delightful, still images. This is why war memorials are so compelling - for they are, at best, such peaceful forms - the guns for the moment having fallen silent.

With many thanks for your consideration, and kindest regards, I am,

Yours sincerely,

Alexander Stoddart

Sculptor in Ordinary to The Queen in Scotland

(Email response received 3 September 2009)